

United States District Court
District of Massachusetts

SAMUEL BARTLEY STEELE, BART)	
STEELE PUBLISHING and STEELE)	
RECORDZ,)	
Plaintiffs,)	Civil Action No.
)	08-11727-NMG
v.)	
)	
TURNER BROADCASTING SYSTEM,)	
INC., TIME WARNER CORPORATION,)	
JON BONGIOVI (individually and)	
d/b/a BON JOVI PUBLISHING),)	
RICHARD SAMBORA (individually)	
and d/b/a AGGRESSIVE MUSIC),)	
WILLIAM FALCONE (individually)	
and d/b/a PRETTY BLUE SONGS),)	
MAJOR LEAGUE BASEBALL)	
PROPERTIES, A&E TELEVISION)	
NETWORKS, AEG LIVE, MARK SHIMMEL)	
MUSIC, UNIVERSAL POLYGRAM)	
INTERNATIONAL PUBLISHING, THE)	
BIGGER PICTURE CINEMA CO.,)	
BOSTON RED SOX, KOBALT MUSIC)	
PUBLISHING AMERICA, INC. and)	
ISLAND DEF JAM RECORDS)	
Defendants.)	

MEMORANDUM & ORDER

GORTON, J.

Pro se plaintiff Samuel Bartley Steele ("Steele") brought suit alleging that a song he wrote about the Boston Red Sox was unlawfully copied and used to create a promotion for baseball. On August 19, 2009, the Court granted summary judgment to defendants after finding no substantial similarity. Steele then filed a motion for reconsideration pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P.

59. He contends first that he was denied the opportunity to present "crucial evidence" and a "more thorough analysis" in a sur-reply brief or at a hearing. Second, he argues that

the Court did not give full and due consideration to (1) Defendants' infringing combination of music/lyrics and images as an independent 'audiovisual' 'work of authorship'...; (2) Plaintiff's originality of selection, coordination and arrangement of unprotectable elements; (3) Plaintiff's originality of expression; (4) synchronization rights as to mechanically 'reproduce' or 'duplicate' under 17 U.S.C. § 106(1).

Steele's arguments are without merit. Pursuant to Rule 59, a motion to reconsider may be granted "only where the movant shows a manifest error of law or newly discovered evidence," Kansky v. Coca-Cola Bottling Co. of New Eng., 492 F.3d 54, 60 (1st Cir. 2007). The Court construes Steele's allegations that this Court did not adequately consider his claims of copying, originality and synch rights as assertions of some form of judicial error. Steele has not, however, proven any manifest error of law and as such, his arguments fall short. Nor do Steele's remaining contentions demonstrate any "newly discovered evidence." Nothing presented in his memorandum was both "not known ... at the time of the trial [and] ... excusable." D. Federico Co., Inc. v. New Bedford Redevelopment Auth., 723 F.2d 122, 130 (1st Cir. 1983). Instead, Steele's motion is replete with attempts to "advance arguments that could and should have been presented to the district court prior to judgment." Aybar v. Crispín-Reyes, 118 F.3d 10, 16 (1st Cir. 1997) (citations

omitted). Accordingly, it will be denied.

ORDER

In accordance with the foregoing, the plaintiff's motion for reconsideration (Docket No. 106) is **DENIED**.

So ordered.

/s/ Nathaniel M. Gorton
Nathaniel M. Gorton
United States District Judge

Dated October 13, 2009

Publisher Information

Note* This page is not part of the opinion as entered by the court.

**The docket information provided on this page is for the benefit
of publishers of these opinions.**

1:08-cv-11727-NMG Steele v. Turner Broadcasting System, Inc. et al

Nathaniel M. Gorton, presiding

Date filed: 10/09/2008

Date terminated: 08/19/2009

Date of last filing: 10/13/2009

Attorneys

Amy B. Auth Dwyer & Collora, LLP 600 representing Kobalt Music Publishing America, Inc.
Atlantic Avenue Suite 1200 Boston, MA (Defendant)
02210 617-371-1032 617-371-1037 (fax)
aauth@dwycollora.com Assigned:

03/11/2009 LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY

TO BE NOTICED

Scott D. Brown Skadden, Arps, Slate, representing A & E/AETV (Defendant)

Meagher & Flom LLP One Beacon Street
31st Floor Boston, MA 02108 617-573-4800
617-573-4822 (fax) sbrown@skadden.com

Assigned: 12/08/2008 LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

AEG Live (Defendant)
Bon Jovi (Defendant)
Bon Jovi Publishing (Defendant)
MLB Productions, A & E (Defendant)
Major League Baseball (Defendant)

Pretty Blue Songs (Defendant)
Time Warner Corporation (Defendant)
Jon Bongiovi (Defendant)
Richard Sambora (Defendant)
William Falcone (Defendant)
Aggressive Music TERMINATED:

04/06/2009 (Defendant)
Vector Management TERMINATED:

04/06/2009 (Defendant)
Fox Television Networks TERMINATED:

04/06/2009 (Defendant)
Sony ATV Tunes TERMINATED:

04/06/2009 (Defendant)
Turner Broadcasting System, Inc.

(Defendant)
The Bigger Picture Cinema Co.

TERMINATED: 04/02/2009 (Defendant)
Mark Shimmel Music (Defendant)
Universal Music Publishing Group

TERMINATED: 04/06/2009 (Defendant)
Universal Polygram TERMINATED:

04/06/2009 (Defendant)
Boston Red Sox (Defendant)
Kobalt Music Publishing America, Inc.

David A. Bunis Dwyer & Collora, LLP 600 representing
Atlantic Avenue Boston, MA 02210-2211
617-371-1000 617-371-1037 (fax)

(Defendant)

dbunis@dwyercollora.com Assigned:

03/11/2009 LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY

TO BE NOTICED

Daniel J. Cloherty Dwyer & Collora LLP 600 representing Kobalt Music Publishing America, Inc.

Atlantic Avenue 12th Floor Boston, MA

(Defendant)

02210 617-371-1000 617-371-1037 (fax)

dcloherty@dwyercollora.com Assigned:

03/11/2009 LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY

TO BE NOTICED

Matthew J. Matule Skadden, Arps, Slate, representing A & E/AETV (Defendant)

Meagher & Flom LLP One Beacon Street
Boston, MA 02108 617-573-4887 617-573-
4822 (fax) mmatule@skadden.com Assigned:

12/08/2008 LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY

TO BE NOTICED

AEG Live (Defendant)
Bon Jovi (Defendant)
Bon Jovi Publishing (Defendant)
MLB Productions, A & E (Defendant)
Major League Baseball (Defendant)
Pretty Blue Songs (Defendant)
Time Warner Corporation (Defendant)
Jon Bongiovi (Defendant)
Richard Sambora (Defendant)
William Falcone (Defendant)
Aggressive Music TERMINATED:

04/06/2009 (Defendant)
Vector Management TERMINATED:

04/06/2009 (Defendant)
Fox Television Networks TERMINATED:

04/06/2009 (Defendant)
Sony ATV Tunes TERMINATED:

04/06/2009 (Defendant)
Turner Broadcasting System, Inc.

(Defendant)
The Bigger Picture Cinema Co.

TERMINATED: 04/02/2009 (Defendant)
Mark Shimmel Music (Defendant)
Universal Music Publishing Group

TERMINATED: 04/06/2009 (Defendant)
Universal Polygram TERMINATED:

04/06/2009 (Defendant)
Boston Red Sox (Defendant)
A & E/AETV (Defendant)

Kenneth A. Plevan Skadden, Arps, Slate, representing

Meagher & Flom 919 Third Avenue New
York, NY 10022-3897 212 735-3000

kplevan@skadden.com Assigned: 12/16/2008

LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE

NOTICED

AEG Live (Defendant)
Bon Jovi (Defendant)
Bon Jovi Publishing (Defendant)
MLB Productions, A & E (Defendant)
Major League Baseball (Defendant)
Pretty Blue Songs (Defendant)
Time Warner Corporation (Defendant)
Turner Broadcasting System, Inc.

(Defendant)
Jon Bongiovi (Defendant)
Richard Sambora (Defendant)
William Falcone (Defendant)
Aggressive Music TERMINATED:

04/06/2009 (Defendant)
Fox Television Networks TERMINATED:

04/06/2009 (Defendant)
Sony ATV Tunes TERMINATED:

04/06/2009 (Defendant)
Vector Management TERMINATED:

04/06/2009 (Defendant)
Boston Red Sox (Defendant)
Mark Shimmel Music (Defendant)
The Bigger Picture Cinema Co.

TERMINATED: 04/02/2009 (Defendant)
Universal Music Publishing Group

TERMINATED: 04/06/2009 (Defendant)
Universal Polygram TERMINATED:

04/06/2009 (Defendant)
A & E/AETV (Defendant)

Clifford M. Sloan Skadden, Arps, Slate, representing

Meagher & Flom LLP 1440 New York
Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20005 202-
371-7000 csloan@skadden.com Assigned:
12/16/2008 LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY
TO BE NOTICED

AEG Live (Defendant)
Bon Jovi (Defendant)
Bon Jovi Publishing (Defendant)
MLB Productions, A & E (Defendant)
Major League Baseball (Defendant)

Pretty Blue Songs (Defendant)
Time Warner Corporation (Defendant)
Turner Broadcasting System, Inc.

(Defendant)
Jon Bongiovi (Defendant)
Richard Sambora (Defendant)
William Falcone (Defendant)
Aggressive Music TERMINATED:

04/06/2009 (Defendant)
Fox Television Networks TERMINATED:

04/06/2009 (Defendant)
Sony ATV Tunes TERMINATED:

04/06/2009 (Defendant)
Vector Management TERMINATED:

04/06/2009 (Defendant)
Boston Red Sox (Defendant)
Mark Shimmel Music (Defendant)
The Bigger Picture Cinema Co.

TERMINATED: 04/02/2009 (Defendant)
Universal Music Publishing Group

TERMINATED: 04/06/2009 (Defendant)
Universal Polygram TERMINATED:

04/06/2009 (Defendant)